

James Hepokoski
Spring 2009
Office Hours (Room 201): Mon, 1:30-3:00
james.hepokoski@yale.edu

Music 845: Methodological Issues in Music History and Analysis

Foundational concerns in confronting a piece of music and the context in which it is embedded. These include: the status of the artwork as an object of interpretation; the existence of multiple layers of implication within a single work; the role of the observer in producing aesthetic or cultural meanings; contending constructions of history and society into which a work might be interwoven. Carl Dahlhaus's *Foundations of Music History* serves as one of the texts from which we shall radiate outward to several interdisciplinary issues: hermeneutics, claims of aesthetic autonomy and relative autonomy, objectivity and evidence, gender-related issues, postmodern challenges, sociological readings of the artwork, and so on.

Books to Purchase:

Bourdieu, Pierre. *The Field of Cultural Production: Essays on Art and Literature* [Selection of essays orig. in French, 1968-1987]. Differing translators. Ed. Randal Johnson. New York: Columbia University Press, 1993.

Dahlhaus, Carl. *Foundations of Music History* [orig. *Grundlagen der Musikgeschichte*, 1977]. Trans. J. B. Robinson. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983.

Gumbrecht, Hans Ulrich. *Production of Presence: What Meaning Cannot Convey*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2004.

Heidegger, Martin. *Poetry, Language, Thought* [containing "The Origin of the Work of Art," orig. lecture, "Der Ursprung des Kunstwerkes," 1935-36]. Trans. Albert Hofstadter. New York: Harper, 2001.

Iser, Wolfgang. *Prospecting: From Reader Response to Literary Anthropology*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 1989.

Makaryk, Irena R., ed. *Encyclopedia of Contemporary Literary Theory: Approaches, Scholars, Terms*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1993.

Seminar Expectations [may be revised, depending on enrollment]:

- Weekly reading and preparation; active seminar participation and interrelating of current and prior readings. Because of the complexity of the subject matter and discussions, seminar sessions will be extended, lasting from two-and-a-half to three hours. Please do not schedule anything crucial in the hour following the “officially listed” seminar time.
- Several semi-formal, 10-minute presentations concerning the assigned reading, or portions thereof, to launch the seminar discussion.
- Three or four short papers (1200-1500 words) based on your oral presentations. Each of these is due one week after the presentation, with electronic copies—pdf or Word files—distributed to all participants in the seminar.
- A final exam covering the basic materials of the seminar.

Pre-Reading (Background in Selected Issues: Assigned before the Seminar’s First Meeting)

- E. D. Hirsch, *Validity in Interpretation* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1967), Preface (pp. vii-xii); Ch. 1, “In Defense of the Author” (pp. 1-23); and excerpts from Ch. 2, “Meaning and Implication” (pp. 24-27, 61-67).
- Karl Popper, “The Problem of Demarcation” [1974], in David Miller, ed., *Popper Selections* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1985), pp. 118-30.
- Fredric Jameson, *The Political Unconscious: Narrative as a Socially Symbolic Act* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1981), Preface (pp. 9-14); and excerpts from Ch. 1, “On Interpretation” (pp. 17-23, 80-102).
- Richard Taruskin, “Introduction: The Meaning of What?” from vol. 1 of Taruskin, *The Oxford History of Western Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2005), pp. xxi-xxx.
- James Hepokoski, “Postmodernism: Some Central Features and Controversies” (unpublished typescript [2002], 15 pp.)
- Zygmunt Bauman, *Intimations of Postmodernity* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992), “Introduction: The Re-enchantment of the World, or, How Can One Narrate Postmodernity” (pp. vii-xxviii); and “A Sociological Theory of Postmodernity” (pp. 187-204).

Seminar Schedule

(Modifications may occur as the semester proceeds.)

Topic 1

Problems of Truth, Interpretation, and Meaning

- Initial Course Handout: JH, typescript, “Classifications of Methodologies and Interests: Some Examples” (framing the content of the seminar; introducing epistemological questions; Ricoeur and the hermeneutic question; six or seven pivotal statements from Marx, etc.)
- Selected entries from *A Companion to Epistemology* [in the series, Blackwell Companions to Philosophy], ed. Jonathan Dancy and Ernest Sosa (Oxford: Blackwell, 1992). In three servings, more or less in this recommended order:
 - “Truth, Theories of” (by Paul Horwich), pp. 509-15.
 - “Foundationalism” (by William P. Alston), pp. 144-47

 - “Evidence” (by Richard Feldman), pp. 119-22.
 - “Popper, Karl” (by Anthony O’Hear), pp. 349-51.
 - “Relativism” (by Harvey Siegel), pp. 428-30.

 - “Feminist Epistemology” (by Lorraine Code), pp. 138-42.
 - “Marxism” (by David Bakhurst), pp. 268-70
- Paul Ricoeur, “The Conflict of Interpretations,” in *Freud and Philosophy: An Essay on Interpretation*, trans. Denis Savage (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1970), pp. 20-37 (assigned: only pp. 26-36).

Topic 2:

Dahlhaus on Marxism, Structuralism, and the Question of Aesthetic Autonomy

- Reading (for Topic 2): Read also the material (along with the JH typescript) assigned for Topic 1: we shall return to these matters more than once during the term.
- James Hepokoski, “The Dahlhaus Project and Its Extra-Musicological Sources,” *19th-Century Music* 14 (1991), 221-46.
- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapters 8 and 9 (the topics of our second meeting).
- Makaryk Cluster: “Metacriticism,” “Marxist Criticism,” “Materialist Criticism,” “Demythologizing,” “Ideology,” “Ideological Horizon,” “Frankfurt School,” “Fredric Jameson,” “Althusser, Louis,” Macherey, Pierre,” “Eagleton, Terry,” “Williams, Raymond,”

Topic 3 **Dahlhaus on Special Problems of Art History (Literary History, Music History, etc.)**

- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapters 1, 2, and 3.
- Anne Shreffler, “Berlin Walls: Dahlhaus, Knepler, and Ideologies of Music History,” *The Journal of Musicology* 20 (2003), 498-525.
- Carl Dahlhaus, “The Twin Styles [Beethoven and Rossini],” from Dahlhaus, *Nineteenth-Century Music*, trans. J. Bradford Robinson (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989).
- James Hepokoski, “Text and Event in the Beethoven-Rossini *Stildualismus*,” unpublished paper (from the Cambridge University conference on “Beethoven and Rossini: Crossing Musical Cultures,” 23 May 2008).
- Makaryk Cluster: “Wellek, René,” “Formalism, Russian,” “Shklovskii, Viktor Borisovich,” “White, Hayden.”

Topic 4 **Filling out the Dahlhaus Project**

- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapter 4, 5, 6, 7.
- Gadamer, *Truth and Method* extracts, pp. 184-197, 294 [bottom]-307, 366-79, 383-89.
- Makaryk Cluster: “Canon,” “Hermeneutics,” “Hirsch, E(ric) D(onald),” “Gadamer, Hans-Georg,” “Habermas, Jürgen.”

Topic 5 **Institution Theory; the “New Empiricism”; The Music Score and Its Functions?**

- Peter Uwe Hohendahl, “Preface” and “Introduction: The Institution of Literature,” from Hohendahl, *Building a National Literature: The Case of Germany, 1830-1870*, trans. Renate Baron Franciscono (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1989), pp. vii-x, 1-43.
- Peter and Christa Bürger, *The Institutions of Art*, trans. Loren Kruger (Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press, 1992), three selections:
 - Loren Kruger, “Translator’s Preface,” pp. vii-ix.
 - Russell A. Berman, “Introduction,” pp. xi-xx.
 - Peter Bürger, “The Institution of Art as a Category of the Sociology of Literature: Toward a Theory of the Historical Transformation of the Social Function of Literature,” pp. 3-29.

- Peter Davies, “Julia’s Gift: The Social Life of Scores,” *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 131 no. 2 (2006), 287-309.
- Roger Parker, “Twin styles in 1830s London: ‘The Form and Order of a Perspicuous Unity,’” unpublished paper (from the Cambridge University conference on “Beethoven and Rossini: Crossing Musical Cultures,” 23 May 2008).
- Makaryk Cluster: “Frankfurt School,” Literary Institution,” “Cultural Materialism,” “Sociocriticism,” “New Historicism,” “Demythologizing,” “Discourse,” Geertz, Clifford.”

Topic 6

Monuments, Memory, Identity

- Pierre Nora, “General Introduction: Between Memory and History” in Nora, director and editor, *Realms of Memory: Rethinking the French Past*, trans. Arthur Goldhammer, Engl. ed. Lawrence D. Kritzman (New York: Columbia University Press, 1998), I, 1-20.
- Eric Hobsbawm, “Introduction: Inventing Traditions,” Ch. 1 of Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger, eds., *The Invention of Tradition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), pp. 1-14.
- Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*, rpt. with added Preface (New York: Routledge, 1999; orig. ed. 1990). “Bodily Inscriptions, Performative Subversions,” pp. 163-80.
- Suzanne G. Cusick, “Feminist Theory, Music Theory, and the Mind/Body Problem” [1994], in *Music/Ideology: Resisting the Aesthetic*, ed. Adam Krimms (London: Routledge, 1998), pp. 37-56.
- Guthrie P. Ramsey, Jr., “Who Hears Here? Black Music, Critical Bias, and the Musicological Skin Trade,” *The Musical Quarterly* 85 (2001), 1-52.
- Michael Puri, “Memory and Melancholy in the Epilogue of Ravel’s *Valses nobles et sentimentales*,” unpublished typescript (draft of chapter 5 of a [six-chapter] forthcoming book, *Memory, Sublimation, and Desire in the Music of Maurice Ravel*).
- Makaryk Cluster: “Feminist Criticism, Anglo-American,” “Feminist Criticism, French,” “Black Criticism,” “Post-Colonial Theory.”

Topic 7

Classic Continental Essays

- Heidegger, “The Origin of the Work of Art” in *Poetry, Language, Thought* (pp. 17-86).
 - cf. T. R. Quigley’s summary at:
<http://homepage.newschool.edu/~quigley/vcs/heidegger-owasum.pdf>
 - Cf. also: Michael Inwood, from *A Heidegger Dictionary* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1999)—excerpts to be announced (“Heidegger and his language,” “being,” “modes of being,” “art and the work,” “thing,” “Dasein,” “unhiddenness, disclosure, and lighting,” “earth,” “world,” and so on).
- Roland Barthes, Roland. *Image—Music—Text* [Selection of essays originally in French, 1961-1973], trans. Stephen Heath. (New York: Noonday, 1977); three essays:
 - “The Death of the Author” (“La mort de l’auteur,” 1968), pp. 142-48.
 - “From Work to Text” (“De l’œuvre au texte,” 1971), pp. 155-64
 - “The Grain of the Voice” (“Le grain de la voix,” 1972), pp. 179-89.
- Makaryk Cluster: “Heidegger, Martin,” “Phenomenological Criticism,” “Barthes, Roland,” “Text,” “Textuality,” “Intertextuality.”

Topic 8

Presence, Performance, Simulacra

- Carolyn Abbate, “Music—Drastic or Gnostic,” *Critical Inquiry* 30 (2004), 505-36.
- Hans Ulrich Gumbrecht: *Production of Presence: What Meaning Cannot Convey* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2004), complete.
- Makaryk Cluster: “Metaphysics of Presence,” “Performance Criticism,” “Baudrillard, Jean.”

Topic 9

Methodological Challenges in Music Analysis, Discussions of the Musical Object

- Nicholas Cook, “Theorizing Musical Meaning,” *Music Theory Spectrum* 23 (2001), 170-95.
- Morgan, Robert P., “The Concept of Unity and Musical Analysis,” *Music Analysis* 22 (2003), 7-50. And subsequent replies to Morgan:

- Agawu, Kofi, “How We Got Out of Analysis, and How to Get Back in Again,” *Music Analysis* 23 (2004), 267-86.
- Korsyn, Kevin, “The Death of Musical Analysis? The Concept of Unity Revisited,” *Music Analysis* 23 (2004), 337-51.
- Chua, Daniel K. L., “Rethinking Unity,” *Music Analysis* 23 (2004), 353-59.
- Kramer, Jonathan D. “The Concept of Disunity and Musical Analysis,” *Music Analysis* 23 (2004), 361-72.
- Dubiel, Joseph, “What We Really Disagree About: A Reply to Robert P. Morgan,” *Music Analysis* 23 (2004), 373-85.
- Makaryk Cluster: “Authority,” “Monologism,” “Polyphony/Dialogism,” “Totalization,” “New Criticism,” “Deconstruction,” “Power,” “Derrida, Jacques,” “De Man, Paul.”

Topic 10

Narratology, Paratexts

- Gérard Genette, *Narrative Discourse: An Essay in Method*, trans. Jane E. Lewin (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1980), extracts:
 - “Introduction,” pp. 25-32.
 - “Order” (excerpt), pp. 000-000
 - “Mood” (excerpt, including “perspective and “focalization”), pp. 161-94.
- McDonald, Matthew. “Silent Narration? Elements of Narrative in Ives’s *The Unanswered Question*,” *19th-Century Music* 27 (2004), 263-86.
- Gérard Genette, *Paratexts: Thresholds of Interpretation*, trans. Jane E. Lewin (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), extracts:
 - Richard Macksey, “Foreword,” pp. xi-xxii.
 - “Introduction,” pp. 1-15.
 - “The Publisher’s Peritext,” pp. 16-36.
 - “The Name of the Author,” pp. 37-54.
 - “Titles,” 55-103.
 - “Dedications and Inscriptions,” pp. 117-43.
- Makaryk Cluster: “Narratology,” “Genette, Gérard,” “Story/Plot,” “Narrator,” “Greimas, A(lgidas) J(ulien).”

Topic 11

Jauss, Iser: Reception Theory; Reader-Response theory; Blanks; Literary Anthropology; Translation Theory

- Hans-Robert Jauss, [Seven Theses from] “Literary History as a Challenge to Literary History,” in Jauss, *Toward an Aesthetic of Reception*, trans. Timothy Bahti (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, pp. 20-45 only.
- Wolfgang Iser, *Prospecting: From Reader Response to Literary Anthropology* (Baltimore, Johns Hopkins University Press, 1989), extracts:
 - “Indeterminacy and the Reader’s Response in Prose Fiction,” pp. 3-30.
 - “Interaction between Text and Reader,” pp. 31-41.
 - “Changing Functions of Literature,” pp. 197-214.
 - “Toward a Literary Anthropology,” pp. 262-84.
- Wolfgang Iser, *The Range of Interpretation* (Baltimore, Johns Hopkins University Press, 1989), extracts:
 - Preface, pp. ix-xv.
 - “Introduction,” pp. 1-12
 - “Configurations of Interpretation: An Epilogue,” pp. 145-58.
- Makaryk Cluster: “Reader-Response Criticism,” “Constance School,” “Ingarden, Roman,” “Jauss, Hans-Robert,” “Iser, Wolfgang,” “Horizon of Expectation,” “Concretization,” “Indeterminacy,” “Implied Reader,” “Genre Criticism,” “Translation, Theories of.”

Topic 12

Bourdieu (1): Transactions in Symbolic Capital, Cultural Capital

- Pierre Bourdieu, *The Field of Cultural Production: Essays on Art and Literature* [Selection of essays orig. in French, 1968-1987], differing translators, ed. Randal Johnson (New York: Columbia University Press, 1993), selected essays:
 - Randal Johnson, “Editor’s Introduction: Pierre Bourdieu on Art, Literature, and Culture,” pp. 1-25. 1
 - Bourdieu, “The Field of Cultural Production, or: The Economic World Reversed,” pp. 29-73 [orig. 1983].
 - “The Production of Belief: Contribution to an Economy of Symbolic Goods,” pp. 74-111 [orig. 1977].
- Makaryk Cluster: “Bourdieu, Pierre Félix,” “Empirical Science of Literature,” “Hegemony.”

Topic 13

Bourdieu (2); Sociological Studies in Music and Literature

- Pierre Bourdieu, *The Field of Cultural Production: Essays on Art and Literature* [Selection of essays orig. in French, 1968-1987], differing translators, ed. Randal Johnson (New York: Columbia University Press, 1993), selected essays:
 - “The Market of Symbolic Goods,” pp. 112-41 [orig. 1971]
 - “Principles for a Sociology of Cultural Works,” pp. 176-91 [orig. 1986].
- Jane F. Fulcher, “Symbolic Domination and Contestation in French Music: Shifting the Paradigm from Adorno to Bourdieu,” in Victoria Johnson, Jane F. Fulcher, and eds., *Opera and Society in Italy and France from Monteverdi to Bourdieu* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), pp. 312-29.
- Thomas Ertman, “Conclusion: Towards a New Understanding of the History of Opera?,” in Victoria Johnson, Jane F. Fulcher, and eds., *Opera and Society in Italy and France from Monteverdi to Bourdieu* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), pp. 351-63.
- Gary Tomlinson, “Monumental Musicology” [review of Richard Taruskin, *The Oxford History of Western Music*, 2006], *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 132 no. 2 (2007), 349-74.