

James Hepokoski  
Spring 2001  
Office Hours (Room 209): Mon, 1:30-3:00  
james.hepokoski@yale.edu

## Music 845b: Methodological Issues in Music History and Analysis

Foundational concerns in confronting a piece of music and the context in which it is embedded. These include: the status of the artwork as an object of interpretation; the existence of multiple layers of implication within a single work; the role of the observer in producing aesthetic or cultural meanings; contending constructions of history and society into which the work might be interwoven. Carl Dahlhaus's *Foundations of Music History* serves as one of the texts from which we shall radiate outward to several interdisciplinary issues: phenomenological hermeneutics, claims of aesthetic autonomy and relative autonomy, objectivity and evidence, gender-related issues, sociological readings of the artwork, and so on.

### Required Purchases:

- Barthes, Roland. *Image—Music—Text* [Selection of essays orig. in French, 1961-1973; contains “The Death of the Author” (“La mort de l’auteur,” 1968), “From Work to Text” (“De l’oeuvre au texte,” 1971), and “The Grain of the Voice” (“Le grain de la voix,” 1972), trans. Stephen Heath. New York: Noonday, 1977.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. *The Field of Cultural Production: Essays on Art and Literature* [Selection of essays orig. in French, 1968-1987]. Differing translators. Ed. Randal Johnson. New York: Columbia Univ. Press, 1993.
- Dahlhaus, Carl. *Foundations of Music History* [orig. *Grundlagen der Musikgeschichte*, 1977]. Trans. J. B. Robinson. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1983.
- DeNora, Tia. *Beethoven and the Construction of Genius: Musical Politics in Vienna, 1792-1803*. Berkeley: Univ. of California, 1995.
- Heidegger, Martin. *Poetry, Language, Thought* [containing “The Origin of the Work of Art,” orig. lecture, “Der Ursprung des Kunstwerkes,” 1935-36]. Trans. Albert Hofstadter. New York: Harper, 1971.
- Iser, Wolfgang. *The Act of Reading: A Theory of Aesthetic Response* [orig. *Der Akt des Lesens. Theorie ästhetischer Wirkung*, 1976]. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 1978.

## Seminar Expectations [may be revised, depending on enrollment]:

- Weekly reading and preparation; active seminar participation and interrelating of current and prior readings.
- Several semi-formal, 10-minute presentations concerning the assigned reading, or portions thereof, to launch the seminar discussion.
- Three or four short papers (1200-1500 words) based on your presentations (each due one week after the presentation, with copies distributed to all participants in the seminar).
- A final exam covering the basic materials of the seminar.

## Seminar Schedule

(Modifications may occur as the semester proceeds.)

Topic 1

### **Problems of Interpretation and Meaning**

- Initial Course Handout: JH, typescript, “Classifications of Methodologies and Interests: Five Examples” (framing the content of the seminar; introducing epistemological questions; Habermas; Ricoeur and the hermeneutic question; five or six pivotal statements from Marx; the recent Iser)
- Catherine Z. Elgin, “Epistemology’s End,” *Considered Judgment* (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1996), pp. 3-20.
- Jürgen Habermas, “Knowledge and Human Interests: A General Perspective” [inaugural lecture, Frankfurt University, 1965], in *Knowledge and Human Interests [Erkenntnis und Interesse, 1968]*, trans. Jeremy Shapiro (Boston: Beacon Press, 1971), pp. 301-17.
- Paul Ricoeur, “The Conflict of Interpretations,” in *Freud and Philosophy: An Essay on Interpretation*, trans. Denis Savage (New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1970), pp. 20-37 (assigned: only pp. 26-36).
- Wolfgang Iser, “Introduction” (Encompassing the subheadings “The Marketplace of Interpretation” and “Interpretation as Translatability”) in *The Range of Interpretation* (New York: Columbia Univ. Press, 2000), pp. 1-12.

Topic 2: **Dahlhaus on Marxism and the Question of Aesthetic Autonomy**

- Reading (for Topic 2): Read also the four essays assigned for Topic 1
- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapter 8.
- Dahlhaus, “The Musical Work of Art as a Subject of Sociology” (orig. “Das musikalische Kunstwerk als Gegenstand der Soziologie,” 1974), in *Schoenberg and the New Music*, trans. Derrick Puffett and Alfred Clayton (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1987), pp. 234-47. [Consider this essay as background—as something of an earlier sketch for Chapter 8 of *Foundations*.]

Topic 3 **Dahlhaus on the Larger Structuralism Question**

- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapter 9.

Topic 4 **Special Problems of Art History (Literary History, Music History, etc.)**

- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapters 1, 2, and 3.
- René Wellek and Austin Warren. *Theory of Literature*, 3rd ed. (San Diego and New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1969), Chs. 4 (“Literary Theory, Criticism, and History”), 5 (“The Mode of Existence of a Literary Work of Art”), and 19 (“Literary History”).
- Roman Ingarden, *The Work of Music and the Problem of Its Identity*, trans. Adam Czerniawski, ed. Jean G. Harrell (Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1986), pp. 9-15, 88-ca. 95, 116-22, 146-ca.153.

Topic 5      **Filling out the Dahlhaus Project (3-hour session?)**

- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapter 4, 5, 6, 7.
- Gadamer, *Truth and Method* extracts, pp. 184-197, 294 [bottom]-307, 366-379, 383-89.
- Stanley Rosen, “Horizontverschmelzung,” in Lewis Edwin Hahn, ed., *The Philosophy of Hans-Georg Gadamer* (Chicago: Open Court, 1997), pp. 207-21 [including a reply from Gadamer].
- Diane P. Michelfelder, “Gadamer on Heidegger on Art,” in Lewis Edwin Hahn, ed., *The Philosophy of Hans-Georg Gadamer* (Chicago: Open Court, 1997), pp. 437-56 [including a reply from Gadamer].

Topic 6      **Hermeneutic Antipodes?**

- Heidegger, “The Origin of the Work of Art.”
- Barthes, “The Death of the Author,” “From Work to Text,” “The Grain of the Voice.”
- JH, typescript: “Postmodernism: Some Central Features and Controversies.”

Topic 7

**Identity Politics; Non-Hegemonic Sites of Perception and Interpretation**

- Carolyn Korsmeyer, “Perceptions, Pleasures, Arts: Considering Aesthetics,” in *Philosophy in a Feminist Voice: Critiques and Reconstructions*, ed. Janet A. Kourany (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1998), pp. 145-72.
- Lorraine Code, “Voice and Voicelessness: A Modest Proposal?,” in *Philosophy in a Feminist Voice: Critiques and Reconstructions*, ed. Janet A. Kourany (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1998), pp. 204-30.
- Steven Best and Douglas Kellner, excerpt from “Marxism, Feminism, and Political Postmodernism,” in *Postmodern Theory: Critical Interrogations* (New York: Guilford Press, 1991), pp. 205-14 only.
- Philip Brett, “Piano Four Hands: Schubert and the Performance of Gay Male Desire,” *19th-Century Music* 21 (1997), 149-76.
- Byron Adams, “The ‘Dark Saying’ of the Enigma: Homoeroticism and the Elgarian Paradox,” *19th-Century Music* 23 (2000), 218-35.
- Howard Pollack, “The Dean of Gay American Composers,” *American Music* 18 (2000), 39-49.

Topic 8

**Gender as Performative; Recent Opera Studies; A Theorist’s View of Schubert**

- [Recommended:] Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*, rpt. with added Preface (New York: Routledge, 1999; orig. ed. 1990). “Bodily Inscriptions, Performative Subversions” (pp. 163-80).
- Mary Ann Smart, “Introduction,” in Smart, ed., *Siren Songs: Representations of Gender and Sexuality in Opera* (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 2000), pp. 3-16.
- Linda and Michael Hutcheon, “Staging the Female Body: Richard Strauss’s *Salome*,” in Smart, ed., *Siren Songs*, pp. 204-21.
- Richard L. Cohn, “As Wonderful as Star Clusters: Instruments for Gazing at Tonality in Schubert,” *19th-Century Music* 22 (1999), 213-232. [cf. Brett, Topic 7]

- Topic 9      **Iser (1): The Reader's (Listener's) Role; Perspectives, Actualizations, Repertoires, Allusions.**
- Iser, *The Act of Reading*, pp. 1-106
- Topic 10     **Iser (2): Filling in Those Blanks?**
- Iser, *The Act of Reading*, pp. 107-231
- Topic 11     **Bourdieu (1): Transactions in Symbolic Capital, Cultural Capital**
- Bourdieu, from *The Field of Cultural Production*:
    0. "Editor's Introduction: Pierre Bourdieu on Art, Literature, and Culture," pp. 1-25. (Editor: Randal Johnson.)
    1. "The Field of Cultural Production, or: The Economic World Reversed," pp. 29-73 [orig. 1983].
    2. "The Production of Belief: Contribution to an Economy of Symbolic Goods," pp. 74-111 [orig. 1977].
- Topic 12     **Bourdieu (2): Sociological Reflections on Art and Academics**
- Bourdieu, from *The Field of Cultural Production*
    3. "The Market of Symbolic Goods," pp. 112-41 [orig. 1971].
    6. "Principles for a Sociology of Cultural Works," pp. 176-91 [orig. 1986].
    8. "Outline of a Sociological Theory of Art Perception," pp. 215-37 [1968].
  - Bourdieu and Loïc Wacquant, *An Invitation to Reflexive Sociology* (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1992), pp. 36-46 ("Epistemic Reflexivity"), 62-71 (conversation with Wacquant: *Homo Academicus*; reflexivity; "short-circuit fallacy"); 83-89 (on art).

Topic 13      **Practical Sociological Applications (Bourdieu-informed work?)**

- DeNora, *Beethoven and the Construction of Genius: Musical Politics in Vienna, 1792-1803*. Complete book or excerpts to be announced.
- 

**[Originally planned as a final “Envoi,” then deleted [as Bourdieu expanded]:]**

- Zygmunt Bauman, “Introduction: The Re-enchantment of the World, or, How Can One Narrate Postmodernity?,” in *Intimations of Postmodernity* (London: Routledge, 1992), pp. vii-xxvii.
- Three articles from the journal *History and Theory*, 1999-2000 [Zagorin-Jenkins debate]:
  1. Perez Zagorin, “History, the Referent, and Narrative: Reflections on Postmodernism Now,” *History and Theory* 38 (1999), 1-24.

Among other things, a criticism of Jenkins’s 1997 anthology for Routledge, *The Postmodern History Reader*.
  2. Keith Jenkins, “A Postmodern Reply to Perez Zagorin,” *History and Theory* 39 (2000), 181-200.
  3. Perez Zagorin, “Rejoinder to a Postmodernist,” *History and Theory* 39 (2000), 201-09.