

James Hepokoski
Spring 2011
Office Hours: Tue, 1:45-3:15
james.hepokoski@yale.edu

Music 828: Late Beethoven



Recent scholarship and its trends. Assuming prior familiarity with the music in question, the seminar is reading-intensive. We shall be obliged to gather in some classic approaches to Beethoven's "late style": background readings taken for granted (or debated with) in more recent Anglophone discussions (Adorno, Dahlhaus, Kerman, Rosen, Lockwood, Kinderman, and so on. More frequently, though, we shall address a selection of newer, divergent interpretations, analyses, and challenges that have emerged within English-language musicology and music theory in the past two decades (Hatten, Agawu, Chua, Rumph, Mathew, Taruskin, Spitzer, and several others). Quick tours through the late piano sonatas and a few other works will lead to more sustained considerations of three string quartets: opp. 127, 132, and 130.

Required Texts:

Hatten, Robert S. *Musical Meaning in Beethoven: Markedness, Correlation, and Interpretation*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1994.

Kerman, Joseph. *The Beethoven Quartets*. New York: Norton, 1966.

Kinderman, William. *Beethoven*. 2nd ed. New York: Oxford University Press, 2009.

Rumph, Stephen. *Beethoven after Napoleon: Political Romanticism in the Late Works*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004.

Spitzer, Michael. *Music as Philosophy: Adorno and Beethoven's Late Style*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2006.

Music 828 assumes that you own copies of the scores to Beethoven's Piano Sonatas and String Quartets (e.g., the Dover Scores of each or other suitable editions). If not, you will need to obtain copies to bring to each class. The assigned readings will be impossible without regular references to scores and, of course, to sound recordings. Here, again, one presumes that you are or will become closely familiar with each of the works to be discussed. To read critical commentaries and debates about works with which one is acquainted only hazily is pointless.

Seminar Expectations (may be revised, depending on enrollment):

- Group reading and discussion, i.e., weekly reading, listening, and preparation; active seminar participation (contributions to the discussion will be important) and interrelating of current and prior readings; some pre-meeting e-mail reply-assignments are possible, TBA.
- Two ten-minute oral presentations concerning your engagement with and assessment of the assigned reading, or portions thereof, to launch the seminar discussion. The final presentation (depending on enrollment) may be expanded in length.
- Initially, two short papers (1800-2000 words, of professional quality) based on your oral presentations. Each of these is due one week after its earlier, oral version, with copies distributed to all participants in the seminar. A third, longer paper (probably ca. 2800-3200 words)—engaging with issues brought up in the reading and discussion all term—will also be assigned: details TBA.

Seminar Schedule: Weekly Topics (alterations may be made *en route*, as circumstances suggest)

Many of the titles below are shortened or bibliographically incomplete. See the separate list, "Late Beethoven: Selected Bibliography" for more complete bibliographical details, along with a list of significant recent writing on the topic.

Week 1. *Missa Solemnis*; Adorno; "Late Style"

(Pre-)Listening:

Beethoven: *Missa Solemnis*, op. 123

(Pre-)Reading :

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, pp. 218-19 (on periodization), 266-79, 298-307 (on the *Missa Solemnis* and the finale of the Ninth)

Drabkin, William. Excerpts from *Beethoven: Missa Solemnis*, "Critical Perspectives," pp. 1-10; and "Preliminaries to the Analysis," pp. 19-27.

Said, "Timeliness and Lateness," Ch. 1 of *On Late Style: Music and Literature against the Grain*, pp. 3-24.

Adorno, from *Beethoven: The Philosophy of Music*, "Late Work without Late Style," pp. 138-41 [fragments 286-305]; and [Text 5], "The Alienated *Magnum Opus*: On the *Missa Solemnis*" [1957], pp. 141-53.

Leppert, "Commentary" [on Adorno on Late Beethoven], pp. 513-28.

Paddison, Max. Extracts from Ch. 6, "The Historical Dialectic of Musical Material," from *Adorno's Aesthetics of Music* (Cambridge, 1993), pp. 218-25, 233-40.

Chua, "On Suicide" and "On Absolute Drivel." From *Absolute Music and the Construction of Meaning*, pp. 266-86. (Also recommended as backdrops to the above chapters: "On History," "On Modernity," and "On Disenchantment," pp. 3-22.)

Week 2. Op. 101; op. 106

Listening:

Beethoven: Piano Sonata in A, op. 101

Beethoven: Piano Sonata in B-flat, op. 106, “Hammerklavier”

Reading:

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, pp. 210-18; 223-32

Rosen, from *The Classical Style*, rev ed., pp. 404-34 (On op. 106; Beethoven as “classical”/“classicist”)

Hatten, *Musical Meaning in Beethoven*, pp. 9-90. (Chapters 1-3.; introducing Hatten’s semiotic approach, beginning with a close study of op. 106/iii)

Supplement: Hatten, from *Musical Meaning in Beethoven*, pp. 91-111 (Ch. 4, on op. 101)

Adorno, “Beethoven’s Late Style” [The *Moments musicaux* 1934 essay], pp. 123-26, along with the separate comments on op. 101 and 106, pp. 126-29.

Recommended head-start (but not to be discussed in this session): Spitzer, from *Music as Philosophy* (introductory to Spitzer’s Adorno-based project: not specifically related here to opp. 101 and 106)

Ch. 1 “Away with All Rules,” pp. 3-14;

Ch. 2, “Styles: the First Movement of Op. 132,” pp. 16-43 [though we shall not focus on his few pages regarding op. 132 until a later session]

Week 3. Op. 109; op. 110; op. 111

Listening:

Beethoven: Piano Sonata in E, op. 109

Beethoven: Piano Sonata in A-flat, op. 110

Beethoven: Piano Sonata in C Minor, op. 111

Reading:

Rosen, from *The Classical Style*, rev ed., pp. 449-512 (Rosen’s interpretation of Beethoven’s late style plus a discussion of op. 110)

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, pp. 239-65.

Kramer, Lawrence, “Beethoven’s Two-Movement Piano Sonatas and the Utopia of Romantic Aesthetics,” at least pp. 21-39, 47-71.

Spitzer, *Music as Philosophy*:

Ch. 3, “Adorno’s Beethoven,” pp. 44-70;

Ch. 4, “Late Landscapes,” pp. 71-112;

from Ch. 5, “Invisible Cities,” pp. 124-33.

Week 4. Differing Positions on Late Beethoven

Listening:

Diabelli Variations, op. 120

Bagatelles, op. 119

Bagatelles, op. 126

Reading:

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, pp. 233-39, 279-89 (on *Diabelli* and Bagatelles).

Adorno, on the Bagatelles, op. 126, pp. 130-32; on other aspects of late style, pp. 134-37.

Dahlhaus, Extracts from *Nineteenth-Century Music*:

“The Twin Styles,” pp. 8-15

“Rossini and Restoration,” pp. 57-64.

“Beethoven: Myth and Reception,” pp. 75-81.

“Beethoven’s Late Style,” pp. 81-88 [concerned especially with the later quartets]

Dahlhaus, “Late Works” from *Ludwig van Beethoven: Approaches to His Music*, pp. 219-37.
[Contains some discussion of material from the late quartets and from *Diabelli*]

Spitzer, *Music as Philosophy* (more considerations of the late piano sonatas)

Revisit Ch. 5, “Invisible Cities,” extract, pp. 113-33.

From Ch. 6, “Ways of World Making,” pp. 147-65.

Ch. 9, “The Persistence of Critical Theory,” 262-80.

To be supplied:

Whittall, “Multi-Tasking,” Review of Spitzer, *The Musical Times*, Autumn 2007, 112-14.

Goehr, Review of Spitzer, *Notes* 2007, 66-68.

Monelle, Review of Spitzer, *Music & Letters* 2008, 413-15.

Dineen, Review of Spitzer, *Spectrum* 2009, 368-73.

Week 5. More Positions on Late Beethoven: Politics?

Listening (the first three casting back to 1813-14):

Wellingtons Sieg, op. 91

Germania, WoO 94

Der Glorreiche Augenblick, op. 136

Overture: *Die Weihe des Hauses*, op. 124 (1822)

Reading:

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, pp. 189-202

Knittel, "Wagner, Deafness, and the Reception of Beethoven's Late Style." *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 51 (1998), 49-82.

Knittel, "The Construction of Beethoven." In Jim Samson, ed., *The Cambridge History of Nineteenth-Century Music*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002. Pp. 118-50.

Taruskin, extracts from *The Oxford History of Western Music*, vol. 2: Chs. 31 and 32: "The First Romantics," pp. 641-89, and "C-Minor Moods," pp. 691-739

Rumph, *Beethoven after Napoleon*, pp. 1-132 (which sets up the later period through an examination of several earlier works and political concerns).

Introduction, pp. 1-8

Ch. 1, "A Kingdom Not of This World," pp. 9-34.

Ch. 2, "The Heroic Sublime," pp. 35-57

Ch. 3, "Promethean History," pp. 58-91

Ch. 4, "1809," pp. 92-108.

Ch. 5, *Contrapunctus I: Prelude and Fugue*," pp. 109-18 (op. 109); pp. 125-32 (op. 111) [skip pp. 119-24 for now]

Mathew, Nicholas. Review of Rumph, *Beethoven after Napoleon*, *Current Musicology* 77 (2004), 123-35.

Mathew, Nicholas. "History under Erasure: *Wellingtons Sieg*, the Congress of Vienna, and the Ruination of Beethoven's Heroic Style." *The Musical Quarterly* 89 (2006), 17-61.

Mathew, Nicholas. "Beethoven's Political Music, the Handelian Sublime, and the Aesthetics of Prostration," *19th-Century Music* 33 (2009), 110-50.

Cook, "The Other Beethoven: Heroism, the Canon, and the Works of 1813-14." *19th-Century Music* 27 (2003), 3-24.

Week 6. Op. 127, first movement

Listening:

String Quartet in E-flat, op. 127 (complete, with emphasis on the first movement)

Reading:

Kerman, *The Beethoven Quartets*, pp. 191-96, 204-10
Kinderman, *Beethoven*, 308-10

Chua, *The "Galitzin" Quartets*, pp. 1-44 (chapter 1 and first part of chapter 2).
Spitzer, *Music as Philosophy*, pp. 133-39.

Rumph, pp. 118-24.

Lodes, "So träumte mir, ich reiste . . . nach Indien': Temporality and Mythology in Op. 127/I."

Krummacher, *Das Streichquartett*, relevant excerpts from pp. 242-56.

Indorf, *Beethovens Streichquartette*, pp. [349-58] 358-65.

Revisit Dahlhaus, "Late Style," pp. 230-31.

Week 7. Op. 127, remaining movements

Listening:

String Quartet in E-flat, op. 127 (complete, with emphasis on the later movements)

Reading:

McKee, Eric. "Alternative Meanings in the First Movement of Beethoven's String Quartet in Eb Major, op. 127: Emergence and Growth from Stagnation and Decline," *Theory and Practice* 24 (1999), 1-27.

Kerman, *The Beethoven Quartets*, pp. 210-18, (223-29, "contrast"), 229-42

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, 310-18

Kinderman, "Beyond the Text: Genetic Criticism and Beethoven's Creative Process."

Indorf, *Beethovens Streichquartette*, pp. 365-83.

Chua, *The "Galitzin" Quartets*, pp. 44-53.

Week 8. Op. 132, first movement

Listening:

String Quartet in A Minor, op. 132 (complete, with emphasis on the first movement)

Reading:

Kerman, *The Beethoven Quartets*, pp. 242-50

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, 318-25

Indorf, *Beethovens Streichquartette*, pp. 384-91.

Adorno, "On the First Movement of the A Minor String Quartet" [fragment 269 from "The Late Style [1]"], pp. 132-34.

Spitzer, *Music as Philosophy*, revisit pp. 17-20, 39-43.

Rumph, *Beethoven after Napoleon*, 133-43

Agawu, "A Semiotic Interpretation of the First Movement of Beethoven's String Quartet in A Minor, op. 132." In *Playing with Signs: A Semiotic Interpretation of Classic Music*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1991. Pp. 110-26.

Clarke, "The First Movement of Beethoven's String Quartet in A Minor, Op. 132," in Clarke, *Ways of Listening*, pp. 156-88.

Chua, *The "Galitzin" Quartets*, Ch. 3 "Unity and Disunity" (pp. 54-106)

Morgan, "The Concept of Unity and Musical Analysis." *Music Analysis* 22 (2003), 7-50.

Chua, "Rethinking Unity," *Music Analysis* 23 (2004), 353-59.

Week 9, Op. 132, movements 1 [continued] and 2

Listening:

String Quartet in A Minor, op. 132

Reading:

Kerman, *The Beethoven Quartets*, at least pp. 250-53

Kinderman, pp. 325-31

Indorf, *Beethovens Streichquartette*, pp. 391-94.

McClary, "The Refuge of Counterconvention," in *Conventional Wisdom: the Content of Musical Form*, pp. 109-38.

Hatten, *Interpreting Musical Gestures and Tropes*, "Discontinuity and Beyond: Fragmentary Subjectivity?," pp. 267-78 (on op. 132/i).

Chua, *The "Galitzin" Quartets*, from Ch. 4, "Rhythm, Time, and Space: The Last Four Movements of op. 132," pp. 107-38 (mvmt. 2, though pp. 126-29 deal with mvmt. 4 in passing).

[start the reading also for next week?]

Week 10. Op. 132, movements 3 (“Heiliger Dankgesang”: our main focus) and (more briefly) 4 and 5; the quartet as a whole

Listening:

String Quartet in A Minor, op. 132

(cf. Symphony No. 9 in D Minor, op. 125, movement 3)

(cf. Piano Sonata in A-flat, op. 110, *arioso dolente* and fugue; cf. Kinderman, 329-30)

Reading:

Kerman, *The Beethoven Quartets*, pp. 253-68.

Kinderman, Beethoven, revisit pp. 318-31, reviewing the entire argument.

Indorf, *Beethovens Streichquartette*, pp. 394-405.

Brandenburg, “The Historical Background to the ‘Heiliger Dankgesang’ in Beethoven’s A-Minor Quartet Op. 132.” In Alan Tyson, ed. *Beethoven Studies 3*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982. Pp. 161-91.

Solomon, “Intimations of the Sacred,” in *Late Beethoven*, pp. 198-212.

Solomon, “The Healing Power of Music,” in *Late Beethoven*, pp. 229-41.

Hatten, *Musical Meaning in Beethoven*, Ch. 7, “Beyond the Hierarchies of Correlation” extract, pp. 196-202 (on the *Heiliger Dankgesang*).

Hatten, *Interpreting Musical Gestures and Tropes*, “Discontinuity and Beyond: Fragmentary Subjectivity?,” pp. 278-86 (on op. 132/v).

Sullivan, *Beethoven: His Spiritual Development* [1927; rpt., New York, Vintage, 1960), pp. 3-17 (“Art and Reality”), 141-47 (“God the Companion”), 148-64 (“The Last Quartets”)

Huxley, *Point Counter Point* [1928], Ch. 37 (final chapter), pp. 425-32.

Korsyn, “J. W. N. Sullivan and the *Heiliger Dankgesang*: Questions of Meaning in Late Beethoven.” *Beethoven Forum* 2, pp. 133-74.

Chua, *The “Galitzin” Quartets*, from Ch. 4, “Rhythm, Time, and Space: The Last Four Movements of op. 132,” pp. pp. 126-29, 138-62 (mvmts. 3, 4 and 5, along with an overview of the whole quartet),

Week 11. Op. 130, movements 1 and 3

Listening:

String Quartet in B-flat, op. 130/i-iii

Reading:

Kerman, *The Beethoven Quartets*, pp. 303-19

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, 331-36.

Indorf, *Beethovens Streichquartette*, pp. 406-21

Revisit Dahlhaus, "Late Works," p. 227.

Spitzer, *Music as Philosophy*, pp. 99-101, 139-47.

Hatten, *Musical Meaning in Beethoven*, Ch. 6, "Thematic Markedness," extract, pp. 133-45.

Chua, *The "Galitzin" Quartets*, from Ch. 6, "Doubles and Parallels," pp. 201-25 (mvmt. 1)

Agawu, *Music as Discourse*, from Ch. 9, "Beethoven, String Quartet, op. 130/i . . .," pp. 281-301.

Chua, *The "Galitzin" Quartets*, from Ch. 5, "Cadences and Closure," pp. 163-65, 175-88 (mvmt. 3)

Hatten, "Expressive Doubling, Topics, Tropes, and Shifts in Level of Discourse: Interpreting the Third Movement of Beethoven's String Quartet in Bb Major, Op. 130." In Hatten, *Interpreting Musical Gestures, Topics, and Tropes: Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2004. Pp. 35-52. Rpt. as "Plenitude as Fulfillment: The Third Movement of Beethoven's String Quartet in Bb, Op. 130." In William Kinderman, ed., *The String Quartets of Beethoven*. Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 2006. Pp. 214-33.

Week 12. Op. 130, movements 5 (Cavatina)

Listening:

String Quartet in B-flat, op. 130/v

Reading:

Kerman, *The Beethoven Quartets*, pp. 196-99

Kinderman, Beethoven, pp. 339-41.

Indorf, *Beethovens Streichquartette*, pp. 421-25

Dahlhaus, revisit "Late Works," 234-37.

Lockwood, "On the Cavatina of Beethoven's String Quartet in B-flat Major, Opus 130" in Lockwood, *Beethoven: Studies in the Creative Process* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1992), pp. 209-17.

Hatten, *Musical Meaning in Beethoven*, Ch. 7, Analysis and Synthesis," pp. 203-23.

Bowden, Sylvia. "Beethoven's 'Distant Beloved': The 'Only One,'" *The Musical Times* 151 (Winter 2010), 23-42.

Chua, *The "Galitzin" Quartets*, from Ch. 5, "Cadences and Closure," pp. 193-200 (Cavatina)

Chua, "Beethoven's Other Humanism," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 62 (2009), 571-645.

Chua, "Listening to the Other: A Counter-Cultural Ear in iPodic Times," *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 135, Special Issue No. 1 (2010), 103-08.

Week 13. Op. 130: the replacement finale and the *Grosse Fuge* (op. 133).

Listening:

String Quartet in B-flat, op. 130 (complete, with emphasis on the later movements, including the *Grosse Fuge* and its subsequent replacement)

Grosse Fuge, op. 133.

Two-Piano Arrangement of the *Grosse Fuge*, op. 134

Reading:

Kerman, *The Beethoven Quartets*, pp. 269-95 (*Grosse Fuge*), 367-79 (new finale).

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, 331-41 (again, as a whole)

Indorf, *Beethovens Streichquartette*, (pp. 425-31), pp. 431-43 (*Grosse Fuge*), 443-50 (replacement finale)

Kramer, Richard, "Between Cavatina and Overture: Opus 130 and the Voices of Narrative," *Beethoven Forum* 1 (1992), 165-89.

Kirkendale, "The 'Great Fugue' Op. 133: Beethoven's 'Art of the Fugue.'" *Acta musicologica* 35 (1963), 14-24.

Chua, *The "Galitzin" Quartets*, from Ch. 6, "Doubles and Parallels," extract, pp. 225-48 (on the *Grosse Fuge*).

Chua, *The "Galitzin" Quartets*, Ch. 7, "Conclusion," pp. 245-48.

Rumph, *Beethoven after Napoleon*, pp. 133-49 (*Grosse Fuge*), 222-45 ("A Modernist Epilogue").