

James Hepokoski
Spring 2008
Office Hours (Room 202): Tue, 1:45-3:15
james.hepokoski@yale.edu

Music 828: Late Beethoven

Close examinations of recent Beethoven scholarship and its trends. Assuming some prior knowledge of the music in question, the seminar is reading-intensive. Of necessity the seminar will be obliged also to gather in some classic approaches to Beethoven's "late style"—essential background readings nearly always taken for granted (or debated with) in more recent Anglophone discussions (Adorno, Dahlhaus, Kerman, Rosen, Lockwood, Solomon, Kinderman, Cooper, and so on. More frequently, though, we shall address a selection of newer, divergent interpretations, analyses, and challenges that have emerged within English-language musicology and music theory in the past two decades (Hatten, Knittel, Chua, Rumph, Taruskin, Buch, Spitzer, and several others). Proceeding chronologically through late Beethoven's major works, the seminar will also afford quick tours through several compositions from 1815 to 1827 (the piano sonatas, the string quartets, the *Diabelli* Variations, the *Missa solemnis*, the Ninth Symphony, and others).

Purchases:

Buch, Esteban. *Beethoven's Ninth: A Political History*. Trans. Richard Miller. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003 [orig. French, 1999].

Hatten, Robert S. *Musical Meaning in Beethoven: Markedness, Correlation, and Interpretation*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1994.

Rumph, Stephen. *Beethoven after Napoleon: Political Romanticism in the Late Works*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004.

Spitzer, Michael. *Music as Philosophy: Adorno and Beethoven's Late Style*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2006.

Recommended:

Kerman, Joseph. *The Beethoven Quartets*. New York: Norton, 1966.

Solomon, Maynard. *Beethoven*. 2nd rev. ed. New York: Schirmer, 1998.

The seminar assumes that you own copies of the scores to Beethoven's Piano Sonatas and String Quartets (e.g., the Dover Scores of each). If not, you will need to obtain copies to bring to each class. The assigned readings will be impossible without regular references to scores (and, of course, to sound recordings. Here, again, we presume that you are or will be closely familiar with each of the works to be discussed).

Seminar Expectations [may be revised, depending on enrollment]:

- Group reading and discussion, i.e., weekly reading and preparation; active seminar participation (contributions to the discussion will be important) and interrelating of current and prior readings; some pre-meeting e-mail reply-assignments are possible, TBA.
- Two or three ten-minute presentations concerning the assigned reading, or portions thereof, to launch the seminar discussion. The final presentation (depending on enrollment) may be expanded to twenty minutes and ask you to present your own views of the topic at hand.
- Three or four short papers (1200-1500 words, of professional quality) based on your presentations. Each of these is due one week after its oral presentation, with copies distributed to all participants in the seminar.

Seminar Schedule: Weekly Topics (alterations may be made *en route*, as circumstances suggest)

Many of the titles below are shortened or bibliographically incomplete. See the separate list, "Late Beethoven: Selected Bibliography" for more complete bibliographical details, along with a more expansive list of significant recent writing on the topic.

Week 1. *Missa Solemnis*; Adorno; "Late Style"

(Pre-)Listening:

Beethoven: *Missa Solemnis*, op. 123

(Pre-)Reading :

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, pp. 238-52 (on the *Missa Solemnis*)

Drabkin, William. Excerpts from *Beethoven: Missa Solemnis*, "Critical Perspectives," pp. 1-10; and "Preliminaries to the Analysis," pp. 19-27.

Said, "Timeliness and Lateness," Ch. 1 of *On Late Style: Music and Literature against the Grain*, pp. 3-24.

Adorno, "Late Work without Late Style," pp. 138-41 [fragments 286-305]; and [Text 5], "The Alienated *Magnum Opus*: On the *Missa Solemnis*" [1957], pp. 141-53.

Leppert, "Commentary" [on Adorno on Late Beethoven], pp. 513-28.

Week 2. Op. 106

Listening:

Beethoven: Piano Sonata in B-flat, op. 106, “Hammerklavier”

Reading:

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, pp. 201-10.

Rosen, from *The Classical Style*, rev ed., pp. 404-34 (On op. 106; Beethoven as “classical”/“classicist”)

Cooper, *Beethoven: The Last Decade*, pp. 157-76.

Hatten, *Musical Meaning in Beethoven*, pp. 9-90. (Chapters 1-3; introducing Hatten’s semiotic approach, beginning with a close study of op. 106/iii)

Week 3. Op. 101; op. 109

Listening:

Piano Sonata in A, op. 101

Piano Sonata in E, op. 109

Reading:

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, 195-99 (op. 101 and periodization); 218-25 (op. 109)

Sisman, “Memory and Invention at the Threshold of Beethoven’s Late Style” (on op. 101, pp. 51-87)

Meredith, “The Origins of Beethoven’s op. 109,” *The Musical Times* 126 (1985), 713-16.
[Leaf through Nicholas Marston: *Beethoven’s Piano Sonata in E, Op. 109.*]

Hatten, from *Musical Meaning in Beethoven*, pp. 91-111 (Ch. 4, on op. 101)

Spitzer, from *Music as Philosophy* (introductory to Spitzer’s Adorno-based project: not specifically related here to opp. 101 and 109)

Ch. 1 “Away with All Rules,” pp. 3-14;

Ch. 2, “Styles: the First Movement of Op. 132,” pp. 16-43 [though we shall not focus on his few pages regarding op. 132 until a later session]

Week 4. op. 110; op. 111

Listening:

Beethoven: Piano Sonata in A-flat, op. 110
Beethoven: Piano Sonata in C Minor, op. 111

Reading:

Rosen, from *The Classical Style*, rev ed., pp. 449-512 (Rosen's interpretation of Beethoven's late style plus a discussion of op. 110)
Kinderman, *Beethoven*, pp. 225-37.
Adorno, "Beethoven's Late Style" [The *Moments musicaux* 1934 essay], pp. 123-26, along with the separate comments on op. 101 and 106, pp. 126-29.
Spitzer, *Music as Philosophy*:
Ch. 3, "Adorno's Beethoven," pp. 44-70;
Ch. 4, "Late Landscapes," pp. 71-112;
Ch. 5, "Invisible Cities," extract, pp. 113-33.
From Ch. 6, "Ways of World Making," pp. 147-65.

Week 5. Differing Positions on Late Beethoven

Listening:

Diabelli Variations, op. 120
Bagatelles, op. 119
Bagatelles, op. 126

Reading:

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, pp. 253-63 (on *Diabelli* and Bagatelles).
Adorno, on the Bagatelles, op. 126, pp. 130-32.
Dahlhaus, Extracts from *Nineteenth-Century Music*:
"The Twin Styles," pp. 8-15
"Rossini and Restoration," pp. 57-64.
"Beethoven: Myth and Reception," pp. 75-81.
"Beethoven's Late Style," pp. 81-88 [concerned especially with the later quartets]
Dahlhaus, "Late Works" from *Ludwig van Beethoven: Approaches to His Music*, pp. 219-37.
[Contains some discussion of material from the late quartets and from *Diabelli*]
Spitzer, *Music as Philosophy*, Ch. 9, "The Persistence of Critical Theory," 262-80.
Knittel, "Wagner, Deafness, and the Reception of Beethoven's Late Style." *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 51 (1998), 49-82.
Knittel, "The Construction of Beethoven." In Jim Samson, ed., *The Cambridge History of Nineteenth-Century Music*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002. Pp. 118-50.

Week 6. More Positions on Late Beethoven

Listening:

Wellingtons Sieg, op. 91

Der Glorreiche Augenblick, op. 136

Overture: *Die Weihe des Hauses*, op. 124

Reading:

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, pp. 170-80, 252-53

Rumph, *Beethoven after Napoleon*, pp. 1-132 (which sets up the later period through an examination of several earlier works and political concerns).

Introduction, pp. 1-8

Ch. 1, "A Kingdom Not of This World," pp. 9-34.

Ch. 2, "The Heroic Sublime," pp. 35-57

Ch. 3, "Promethean History," pp. 58-91

Ch. 4, "1809," pp. 92-108.

Ch. 5, "Contrapunctus I: Prelude and Fugue," pp. 109-18 (op. 109); pp. 125-32 (op. 111) [skip pp. 119-24 for now]

Taruskin, extracts from *The Oxford History of Western Music*, vol. 2: Chs. 31 and 32: "The First Romantics," pp. 641-89, and "C-Minor Moods," pp. 691-739

Mathew, Nicholas. "History under Erasure: *Wellingtons Sieg*, the Congress of Vienna, and the Ruination of Beethoven's Heroic Style." *The Musical Quarterly* 89 (2006), 17-61.

Cook, "The Other Beethoven: Heroism, the Canon, and the Works of 1813-14." *19th-Century Music* 27 (2003), 3-24.

Week 7. Ninth Symphony finale: interpretive and political questions

Solomon, "The Sense of an Ending: The Ninth Symphony." *Late Beethoven: Music, Thought, Imagination*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003. Pp. 213-28.

Solomon, "The Ninth Symphony: A Search for Order." In Solomon, *Beethoven Essays*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988. Pp. 3-32.

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, pp. 263-83.

Buch, *Beethoven's Ninth: A Political History*. Selections:

"*God Save the King* and the Handel Cult." Pp. 11-25.

"The *Ode to Joy* and the Emperor's Anthem." Pp. 45-65.

"The Ninth Symphony." Pp. 87-108.

"From Apartheid's Anthem to the Dismantling of the Berlin Wall." Pp. 243-62.

"Conclusion." Pp. 263-67.

Parsons "'Deine Zauber binden wieder': Beethoven, Schiller, and the Joyous Reconciliation of Opposites," *Beethoven Forum* 9 (2002), 1-53

Rehding, "Ode to Freedom: Bernstein's Ninth at the Berlin Wall." *Beethoven Forum* 12 No. 1 (2005), 36-49.

Rumph, *Beethoven after Napoleon*, pp. 156-221.

Ch. 7, "Androgynous Utopias," pp. 156-94

Ch. 8, "Vox Populi, Vox Dei," pp. 195-221.

Spitzer, *Music as Philosophy*, pp. 182-90.

Week 8. Op. 127, first movement: (emphasis: Kerman, Kinderman, Chua, Spitzer, Lodes)

Listening:

String Quartet in E-flat, op. 127 (complete, with emphasis on mvts. 1 and 4)

Reading:

Kerman, *The Beethoven Quartets*, pp. 191-210

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, 284-94

Chua, *The "Galitzin" Quartets*, pp. 1-52. (chapters 1 and 2)

Spitzer, *Music as Philosophy*, pp. 133-39.

Rumph, pp. 118-24.

Lodes, "So träumte mir, ich reiste . . . nach Indien': Temporality and Mythology in Op. 127/I."

Krummacher, *Das Streichquartett* [2001], relevant excerpts from pp. 242-56.

Indorf, *Beethovens Streichquartette*, pp. [349-58] 358-65.

Revisit Dahlhaus, "Late Style," pp. 230-31.

Week 9. Op. 132, first movement

Listening:

String Quartet in A Minor, op. 132 (complete, with emphasis on the first movement)

Reading:

Kerman, *The Beethoven Quartets*, pp. 242-50

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, 294-99

Chua, *The "Galitzin" Quartets*, Ch. 3 "Unity and Disunity" (pp. 54-106)

Agawu, "A Semiotic Interpretation of the First Movement of Beethoven's String Quartet in A Minor, op. 132." In *Playing with Signs: A Semiotic Interpretation of Classic Music*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1991. Pp. 110-26.

Morgan, "The Concept of Unity and Musical Analysis." *Music Analysis* 22 (2003), 7-50.

Rumph, *Beethoven after Napoleon*, 133-43

McClary, "The Refuge of Counterconvention," in *Conventional Wisdom: the Content of Musical Form*, pp. 109-38.

Hatten, "Discontinuity and Beyond: Fragmentary Subjectivity? Beethoven, String Quartet in A Minor, op. 132, First Movement."

Neumeyer, David, [draft chapter], "Analytic Diversity and Institutional Discourse: Views of Beethoven, String Quartet in A Minor, op. 132, I," in the forthcoming *Linear Analysis of Music: Conventions and Contexts*, pp. 1-62.

Spitzer, *Music as Philosophy*, revisit pp. 17-20, 39-43.

Week 10. Op. 132, concluding movements

Listening:

String Quartet in A Minor, op. 132 (complete, with emphasis on the later movements)

Reading:

- Brandenburg, “The Historical Background to the ‘Heiliger Dankgesang’ in Beethoven’s A-Minor Quartet Op. 132.” In Alan Tyson, ed. *Beethoven Studies 3*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982. Pp. 11-91.
- Sullivan, *Beethoven: His Spiritual Development* [1927; rpt., New York, Vintage, 1960], pp. 3-17 (“Art and Reality”), 141-47 (“God the Companion”), 148-64 (“The Last Quartets”)
- Huxley, *Point Counter Point* [1928], Ch. 37 (final chapter), pp. 425-32.
- Korsyn, “J. W. N. Sullivan and the *Heiliger Dankgesang*: Questions of Meaning in Late Beethoven.” *Beethoven Forum 2*, pp. 133-74.
- Kerman, *The Beethoven Quartets*, pp. 253-68
- Chua, *The “Galitzin” Quartets*, Ch. 4, “Rhythm, Time, and Space: The Last Four Movements of op. 132,” pp. 107-60.
- Solomon, “The Healing Power of Music,” in *Late Beethoven*, pp. 229-41.
- Rumph, *Beethoven after Napoleon* (see last week)
- Hatten, *Musical Meaning in Beethoven*, Ch. 7, “Beyond the Hierarchies of Correlation” extract, pp. 196-202.
- Hatten, revisit “Discontinuity and Beyond,” concluding portion on op. 127/iv.

Week 11. Op. 130, first three movements

Listening:

String Quartet in B-flat, op. 130/i-iii

Reading:

- Kerman, *The Beethoven Quartets*, pp. 303-25.
- Kinderman, *Beethoven*, 299-301.
- Revisit Dahlhaus, “Late Works,” p. 227.
- Hatten, *Musical Meaning in Beethoven*, Ch. 6, “Thematic Markedness,” extract, pp. 133-45.
- Hatten, “Expressive Doubling, Topics, Tropes, and Shifts in Level of Discourse: Interpreting the Third Movement of Beethoven’s String Quartet in Bb Major, Op. 130.” In Hatten, *Interpreting Musical Gestures, Topics, and Tropes: Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2004. Pp. 35-52. Rpt. as “Plenitude as Fulfillment: The Third Movement of Beethoven’s String Quartet in Bb, Op. 130.” In William Kinderman, ed., *The String Quartets of Beethoven*. Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 2006. Pp. 214-33.
- Chua, *The “Galitzin” Quartets*, from Ch. 6, “Doubles and Parallels,” pp. 201-25 (first movement); 162-88 (second and third movements)
- Rumph, *Beethoven after Napoleon*, 143-49
- Spitzer, *Music as Philosophy*, pp. 139-47.

Week 12. Op. 130, concluding movements (with emphasis on the Cavatina, the “later” finale, and the *Grosse Fuge*).

Listening:

String Quartet in B-flat, op. 130 (complete, with emphasis on the later movements, including the *Grosse Fuge* and its subsequent replacement)

Reading:

Kerman, *The Beethoven Quartets*, pp. 191-99, 269-95 (*Grosse Fuge*), 367-79.

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, 301-07

Dahlhaus, revisit “Late Works,” 234-37.

Hatten, *Musical Meaning in Beethoven*, Ch. 7, Analysis and Synthesis,” pp. 203-23.

Lockwood, “On the Cavatina of Beethoven’s String Quartet in B-flat Major, Opus 130.”

Notley, “Adagios in Brahms’s Late Chamber Music: Genre Aesthetics and Cultural Critique.” In Notley, *Lateness and Brahms: Music and Culture in the Twilight of Viennese Liberalism*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2007. Pp. 169-203 (especially pp. 169-79)

Chua, *The “Galitzin” Quartets*

Ch. 5, pp. 188-200, “Cadences and Closure: The Middle Movements of Op. 130” [of the fourth and fifth movements]

Ch. 6, “Doubles and Parallels,” extract, pp. 225-48 [on the *Grosse Fuge*].

Kirkendale, “The ‘Great Fugue’ Op. 133: Beethoven’s ‘Art of the Fugue.’” *Acta musicologica* 35 (1963), 14-24.

Rumph, *Beethoven after Napoleon*, 135-38, 143-49.

Week 13. Op. 131

Listening:

String Quartet in C-sharp Minor, op. 131 (complete)

Reading:

Kerman, *The Beethoven Quartets*, pp. 325-49

Kerman, “Opus 131 and the Uncanny.” In William Kinderman, ed., *The String Quartets of Beethoven*. Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 2006. Pp. 262-78.

Kinderman, *Beethoven*, 308-25

Kinderman, “Beethoven’s Last Quartets: Threshold to a Fourth Creative Period?”

Hatten, *Musical Meaning in Beethoven*, Ch. 6, “Thematic Markedness,” extract, pp. 145-60.

Rumph, *Beethoven after Napoleon*, from Ch. 6, “Contrapunctus II,” pp. 149-55. and Chapter 9, “A Modernist Epilogue,” pp. 222-45

Chua, selections from *Absolute Music and the Construction of Meaning*

“On History,” pp. 3-7

“On Modernity,” pp. 8-11

“On Disenchantment,” pp. 12-22

“On Division,” pp. 23-28

“On Absolute Drivel.” in pp. 276-86 [discusses op. 131]

“On Babel,” pp. 287-90

Spitzer, *Music as Philosophy*, pp. 169-79; revisit pp. 113-17.