

James Hepokoski
Spring 2005
Office Hours (Room 209): Mon, 1:30-3:00
james.hepokoski@yale.edu

Music 845: Methodological Issues in Music History and Analysis

Foundational concerns in confronting a piece of music and the context in which it is embedded. These include: the status of the artwork as an object of interpretation; the existence of multiple layers of implication within a single work; the role of the observer in producing aesthetic or cultural meanings; contending constructions of history and society into which the work might be interwoven. Carl Dahlhaus's *Foundations of Music History* serves as one of the texts from which we shall radiate outward to several interdisciplinary issues: phenomenological hermeneutics, claims of aesthetic autonomy and relative autonomy, objectivity and evidence, gender-related issues, postmodern challenges, sociological readings of the artwork, and so on.

Required Purchases:

- Barthes, Roland. *Image—Music—Text* [Selection of essays orig. in French, 1961-1973; contains “The Death of the Author” (“La mort de l’auteur,” 1968), “From Work to Text” (“De l’oeuvre au texte,” 1971), and “The Grain of the Voice” (“Le grain de la voix,” 1972), trans. Stephen Heath. New York: Noonday, 1977.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. *The Field of Cultural Production: Essays on Art and Literature* [Selection of essays orig. in French, 1968-1987]. Differing translators. Ed. Randal Johnson. New York: Columbia University Press, 1993.
- Dahlhaus, Carl. *Foundations of Music History* [orig. *Grundlagen der Musikgeschichte*, 1977]. Trans. J. B. Robinson. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983.
- Heidegger, Martin. *Poetry, Language, Thought* [containing “The Origin of the Work of Art,” orig. lecture, “Der Ursprung des Kunstwerkes,” 1935-36]. Trans. Albert Hofstadter. New York: Harper, 1971.
- Iser, Wolfgang. *The Act of Reading: A Theory of Aesthetic Response* [orig. *Der Akt des Lesens. Theorie ästhetischer Wirkung*, 1976]. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 1978.
- Jenkins, Keith. *Re-Thinking History*. New York: Routledge, 1991 [rpt. Routledge Classic 2003).
- Korsyn, Kevin. *Decentering Music: A Critique of Contemporary Musical Research*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2003.

Seminar Expectations [may be revised, depending on enrollment]:

- Weekly reading and preparation; active seminar participation and interrelating of current and prior readings. (Note: because of the complexity of the subject matter and discussions, several sessions may extend past two hours. Please do not schedule anything crucial in the hour following the “official” seminar time.)
- Several semi-formal, 10-minute presentations concerning the assigned reading, or portions thereof, to launch the seminar discussion.
- Three or four short papers (1200-1500 words) based on your presentations (each due one week after the presentation, with copies distributed to all participants in the seminar).
- A final exam covering the basic materials of the seminar.

Pre-Reading (Background in Selected Issues: Assigned before the Seminar’s First Meeting)

- James Hepokoski, “Postmodernism: Some Central Features and Controversies” (typescript, 15 pp.).
- Keith Jenkins, *Re-Thinking History* (complete book)
- Michael S. Roth, Review of Keith Jenkins, *Refiguring History, History and Theory* 43 (2004), 372-78. (Note: this is a review of an updated successor to the Jenkins book above.)
- David Christian, Review of John Gaddis, *The Landscape of History: How Historians Map the Past, History and Theory* 43 (2004), 360-71.
- Lawrence Kramer, “Musicology and Meaning,” *The Musical Times* 144 (Summer 2003), 6-12.
- Peter Williams, “Peripheral Visions?” *The Musical Times* 145 (Spring 2004), 51-67.
- Robert S. Nelson, “The Map of Art History,” *Art Bulletin* 79 (1997), 28-40.
- Robert S. Nelson, “The Slide Lecture, or The Work of Art *History* in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction,” *Critical Inquiry* 26 (2000), 414-34.

Seminar Schedule

(Modifications may occur as the semester proceeds.)

Topic 1

Problems of Truth, Interpretation, and Meaning

- Initial Course Handout: JH, typescript, “Classifications of Methodologies and Interests: Some Examples” (framing the content of the seminar; introducing epistemological questions; Ricoeur and the hermeneutic question; six or seven pivotal statements from Marx, etc.)

- Selected entries from *A Companion to Epistemology* [in the series, Blackwell Companions to Philosophy], ed. Jonathan Dancy and Ernest Sosa (Oxford: Blackwell, 1992). In three servings, more or less in this recommended order:
 - “Truth, Theories of” (by Paul Horwich), pp. 509-15.
 - “Foundationalism” (by William P. Alston), pp. 144-47
 - “Coherentism” (by Keith Lehrer), pp. 67-70.
 - “Pragmatism” (by Susan Haack), pp. 351-57.

 - “Evidence” (by Richard Feldman), pp. 119-22.
 - “Popper, Karl” (by Anthony O’Hear), pp. 349-51.
 - “Relativism” (by Harvey Siegel), pp. 428-30.

 - “Social Sciences, Epistemology of” (by Fred D’Agostino), pp. 479-83.
 - “Feminist Epistemology” (by Lorraine Code), pp. 138-42.
 - “Marxism” (by David Bakhurst), pp. 268-70
 - “Continental Epistemology” (by Linda Alcoff), pp. 76-81.

- Paul Ricoeur, “The Conflict of Interpretations,” in *Freud and Philosophy: An Essay on Interpretation*, trans. Denis Savage (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1970), pp. 20-37 (assigned: only pp. 26-36).

Topic 2: **Dahlhaus on Marxism, Structuralism, and the Question of Aesthetic Autonomy**

- Reading (for Topic 2): Read also the material (along with the JH typescript) assigned for Topic 1: we shall return to these matters more than once during the term.
- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapters 8 and 9 (the topics of our second meeting).
- “Autonomy, Poetic,” “Marxist Criticism,” and “Historicism” entries from *The New Princeton Encyclopedia of Poetry and Poetics* (henceforth NPEPP). Note: additional entries from NPEPP—photocopies on reserve—will be assigned in subsequent weeks, even though some of them do not appear in the syllabus.

Topic 3 **Dahlhaus on Special Problems of Art History (Literary History, Music History, etc.)**

- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapters 1, 2, and 3.
- Anne Shreffler, “Berlin Walls: Dahlhaus, Knepler, and Ideologies of Music History,” *The Journal of Musicology* 20 (2003), 498-525.
- René Wellek and Austin Warren. *Theory of Literature*, 3rd ed. (San Diego and New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1969), Chs. 4 (“Literary Theory, Criticism, and History”), 12 (“The Mode of Existence of a Literary Work of Art”), and 19 (“Literary History”).
- Roman Ingarden, *The Work of Music and the Problem of Its Identity*, trans. Adam Czerniawski, ed. Jean G. Harrell (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1986), pp. 9-15, 88-ca. 95, 116-22, 146-ca.153.

Topic 4 **Filling out the Dahlhaus Project**

- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapter 4, 5, 6, 7.
- Gadamer, *Truth and Method* extracts, pp. 184-197, 294 [bottom]-307, 366-79, 383-89.
- “Hermeneutics” entry from NPEPP, on reserve.

Topic 5

Classic Continental Essays

- Michael Inwood, from *A Heidegger Dictionary* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1999)— excerpts to be announced (“Heidegger and his language,” “being,” “modes of being,” “art and the work,” thing,” “Dasein,” “unhiddenness, disclosure, and lighting,” “earth,” “world,” and so on).
- Heidegger, “The Origin of the Work of Art.”
- Barthes, “The Death of the Author,” “From Work to Text,” “The Grain of the Voice.” (cf. “Intertextuality” and “Textuality” from NPEPP, on reserve.)

Topic 6

Identity Politics; Non-Hegemonic Sites of Perception and Interpretation

- Carolyn Korsmeyer, “Perceptions, Pleasures, Arts: Considering Aesthetics,” in *Philosophy in a Feminist Voice: Critiques and Reconstructions*, ed. Janet A. Kourany (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998), pp. 145-72. (Cf. entry, “Feminist Poetics” in NPEPP, on reserve.)
- Lorraine Code, “Voice and Voicelessness: A Modest Proposal?,” in *Philosophy in a Feminist Voice: Critiques and Reconstructions*, ed. Janet A. Kourany (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998), pp. 204-30.
- Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*, rpt. with added Preface (New York: Routledge, 1999; orig. ed. 1990). “Bodily Inscriptions, Performative Subversions,” pp. 163-80.
- Suzanne G. Cusick, “Feminist Theory, Music Theory, and the Mind/Body Problem” [1994], in *Music/Ideology: Resisting the Aesthetic*, ed. Adam Krims (London: Routledge, 1998), pp. 37-56.
- Guthrie P. Ramsey, Jr., “Who Hears Here? Black Music, Critical Bias, and the Musicological Skin Trade,” *The Musical Quarterly* 85 (2001), 1-52.
- Bruce Holsinger, *Music, Body, and Desire in Medieval Culture: Hildegard of Bingen to Chaucer* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001): “Introduction,” pp. 1-23; “Polyphones and Sodomites: Music and Sexual Dissidence from Leoninus to Chaucer’s Pardoner,” pp. 137-87; “Epilogue: Toward a Musicology of Empathy,” pp. 344-57.
 - Judith Peraino, rev. of Holsinger, in *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 57 (2004), 374-84

Topic 7

Methodological Challenges in Music Theory

- Alan Street, “Superior Myths, Dogmatic Allegories: The Resistance to Musical Unity” [1989], in *Music/Ideology: Resisting the Aesthetic*, ed. Adam Krims (London: Routledge, 1998), pp. 57-112.
- Henry Klumpenhower, “Commentary: Poststructuralism and Issues of Music Theory,” in *Music/Ideology: Resisting the Aesthetic*, ed. Adam Krims (London: Routledge, 1998), pp.289-310
- Nicholas Cook, “Theorizing Musical Meaning,” *Music Theory Spectrum* 23 (2001), 170-95.
- Richard Cohn, “Uncanny Resemblances: Tonal Signification in the Freudian Age,” *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 57 (2004), 284-323.
- Three Defenses of Analysis from the Twentieth-Anniversary “Special Issue” of *Music Analysis* 21 (2002):
 - Anthony Pople, “Analysis: Past, Present, and Future,” pp. 17-21.
 - Christian Martin Schmidt, “Music Analysis: Not Universal, not Almighty, but Indispensable,” pp. 23-27.
 - Arnold Whittall, “Then and Now: Or, Analysts are Human Too,” pp. 29-33.

Topic 8

A New Overview, a Diagnosis, and a Prescription

- Kevin Korsyn, *Decentering Music* (complete)

Topic 9

Music as Performance, Recovered Politics, Popular Music

- Mary Ann Smart, “In Praise of Overstatement,” in *Mimomania: Music and Gesture in Nineteenth-Century Opera* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), pp. 1-31.
- Carolyn Abbate, *In Search of Opera* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2001): “Orpheus, One Last Performance,” pp. 1-54.
- Carolyn Abbate, “Music—Drastic or Gnostic,” *Critical Inquiry* 30 (2004), 505-36.
- Howard Pollack, *Aaron Copland* (New York: Henry Holt, 1999), pp. 270-87 [politics, 1930s and 1940s], and. 518-31 (“Identity Issues”).
- Elizabeth B. Crist, “Copland and the Popular Front,” *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, 56 (2003), 409-65.
- Robert Fink, “Elvis Everywhere: Musicology and Popular Music Studies at the Twilight of the Canon,” *American Music* (1998), 136-79.
- Robert Walser, “Popular Music Analysis: Ten Apothegms and Four Instances,” in Allan F. Moore, ed., *Analyzing Popular Music* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), pp. 16-38.
- Adam Krims, “Marxist Music Analysis without Adorno: Popular Music and Urban Geography,” in Allan F. Moore, ed., *Analyzing Popular Music* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), pp. 131-57.

Topic 10

Iser (1): The Reader’s (Listener’s) Role; Perspectives, Actualizations, Repertoires, Allusions.

- Iser, *The Act of Reading*, pp. 1-106.
- “Reader-Response Criticism” entry from NPEPP.

Topic 11

Iser (2): Filling in Those Blanks?

- Iser, *The Act of Reading*, pp. 107-231

Topic 12

Bourdieu (1): Transactions in Symbolic Capital, Cultural Capital

- Bourdieu, from *The Field of Cultural Production*:
 0. “Editor’s Introduction: Pierre Bourdieu on Art, Literature, and Culture,” pp. 1-25. (Editor: Randal Johnson.)
 1. “The Field of Cultural Production, or: The Economic World Reversed,” pp. 29-73 [orig. 1983].
 2. “The Production of Belief: Contribution to an Economy of Symbolic Goods,” pp. 74-111 [orig. 1977].

Topic 13

Bourdieu (2); Sociological Studies in Music and Literature

- Bourdieu, from *The Field of Cultural Production*
 3. “The Market of Symbolic Goods,” pp. 112-41 [orig. 1971].
 6. “Principles for a Sociology of Cultural Works,” pp. 176-91 [orig. 1986].
- Jane Fulcher, “The Politics of Transcendence: Ideology in the Music of Messiaen in the 1930s,” *The Musical Quarterly* 86 (2002), 449-71.
- Margaret Cohen, “Introduction: Reconstructing the Literary Field,” in *The Sentimental Education of the Novel* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1999), pp. 3-25.
- David Gramit, *Cultivating Music: The Aspirations, Interests, and Limits of German Musical Culture, 1770-1848* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002), Chapter 1, “Introduction: Cultivating Music,” pp. 1-26 (and glance at Chapter 5, “Performing Musical Culture: The Concert,” pp. 125-60).
- Kiri Miller, “Americanism Musically: Nation, Evolution, and Public Education at the Columbian Exposition, 1893,” *19th-Century Music* 27 (2003), 137-55.