

James Hepokoski
Winter 1999
Office Hours: Wed, 1:30-3:00
hepok001@maroon.tc.umn.edu

Music 8840: Current Issues in Historiography

Investigation of philosophical and practical problems surrounding the writing of history, with special attention to those problems associated with historical inquiries into music. Throughout, the emphasis is placed on the analysis of competing foundational principles of historiography as well as on some of the discipline-specific issues and debates in present-day history, musicology, and music theory. These include controversies surrounding: marxism, structuralism and poststructuralism (Foucault, Derrida), postmodernism, special problems of music history, aesthetic autonomy and relative autonomy, objectivity and evidence, different views of “meaning” and historical “truth,” historical narratives (Hayden White), confronting a pre-existing canon, political interpretation and advocacy positions, and so on. Carl Dahlhaus’s *Foundations of Music History* serves as a central text from which we shall radiate outward to other issues.

Required Purchases:

Appleby, Joyce, Hunt, Lynn, and Jacob, Margaret. *Telling the Truth about History*. New York: Norton, 1994.

Berkhofer, Robert F., Jr. *Beyond the Great Story: History as Text and Discourse*. Cambridge: Harvard Univ. Press, 1995.

Dahlhaus, Carl. *Foundations of Music History* [orig. *Grundlagen der Musikgeschichte*, 1977]. Trans. J. B. Robinson. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1983.

Fay, Brian. *Contemporary Philosophy of Social Science: A Multicultural Approach*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1996.

Makaryk, Irena, ed. *Encyclopedia of Contemporary Literary Theory: Approaches, Scholars, Terms*. Toronto: Univ. of Toronto Press, 1993.

White, Hayden. *The Content of the Form: Narrative Discourse and Historical Representation*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 1987.

Seminar Expectations:

- Weekly reading and preparation; active seminar participation and consistent ability to interrelate current and prior readings.
- Several semi-formal, 7-10-minute presentations concerning the assigned reading, or portions thereof, to launch the seminar discussion.
- Three or four short papers (1200-1500 words) based on your presentations (each due one week after the presentation, with copies distributed to all participants in the seminar).
- One final historiographical (3500-4000 words) paper whose topic is to be determined.

Seminar Schedule

(Modifications may occur as the semester proceeds.)

Topic 1

Introduction to the Seminar: Hermeneutic Modes, etc.

Reading: after the first seminar session:

- Ricoeur, "The Conflict of Interpretations" (especially pp. 26-36).
- Ranke, Introduction to the *History of the Latin and Teutonic Nations*.
- Appleby, Hunt, Jacob, Introduction (pp. 1-12) and Chapters 5 and 6 (pp. 160-237).
- Novick, "Introduction: Nailing Jelly to the Wall" (pp. 1-17) and look briefly at Chapter 15, "The Center Does Not Hold" (with closer attention to pp. 522-24 [intr.], 526-37 [Kuhn, Foucault], 537-46 [anti-foundationalism], 551-54 [Geertz], 563-72 [reactions, debates]).
- Berkhofer, Chapter 1, "Postmodern Challenges."

Topic 2: **Marxism and the Question of Aesthetic Autonomy (Dahlhaus, Ch. 8)**

Reading (for Topic 2):

- Makaryk: Cluster 1 (Marxist Criticism)
- Makaryk: Cluster 2 (Russian Formalism, Wellek)
- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapter 8.

Be prepared to summarize the main ideas in Dahlhaus—paragraph by paragraph—for class discussion. What is the structure of the argument?
- Marx-Engels Packet (to be supplied)
- Kramer, excerpt from “Epilogue à 4: Autonomy, Elvis, and Fingering Bach,” in *Classical Music and Postmodern Knowledge* (pp. 227-29, photocopies to be supplied)
- Eagleton, “Two Approaches in the Sociology of Literature”
- Williams, *Marxism and Literature* excerpts (Six chapters: II.1, “Base and Superstructure”; II.2, “Determination”; II.6, “Hegemony”; II.8, “Dominant, Residual, and Emergent”; II.9, “Structures of Feeling”; III.2. “Aesthetic and Other Situations”)
- Luhmann, “The Work of Art and the Self-Reproduction of Art” (theory of autopoiesis).

Topic 3 **Structuralism – Models of Art, Self, and Society**

- Makaryk Cluster 3 (Structuralism, Semiotics)
- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapter 9.
- Fay, *Contemporary Philosophy of Social Science*, Chapters 1-4, pp. 1-91.
- Giddens, *The Constitution of Society*, “Introduction,” pp. xiii-xxxvi [only] and pp. 16-28 (a sample of the discussion of “rules” within the theory of structuration).

Topic 4 **Special Problems of “Art History” (Literary History, Music History, etc.)**

- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapters 1 and 2.
- Wellek-Warren, Chs. 4 (“Literary Theory, Criticism, and History”), 12 (“The Mode of Existence of a Literary Work of Art”), and 19 (“Literary History”) (Review Makaryk: “Wellek”)
- Essay from Lentricchia, *Critical Terms for Literary Study*: Patterson, “Literary History.”

- Jauss, “Literary History as Challenge”
- Makaryk Cluster 4 (Reader Response Criticism, Jauss, Phenomenological Criticism, Intentionality and Ingarden)
- Ingarden, *The Work of Music and the Problem of Its Identity*, extracts, pp. 9-15, 88-ca. 95, 116-22, 146-ca.153.

- Hepokoski, “The Dahlhaus Project.”

Topic 5 **Science, “Truth,” Evidence, Fact, Objectivity/Bias, Knowledge/Power, Postmodern Decentering, Humanism and Anti-Humanism, etc.**

- “Truth” Photocopies (to be supplied: different philosophical conceptions of truth)
- Hepokoski, “Postmodernism” typescript (to be supplied)
- Popper, “The Problem of Demarcation”; “Truth and Approximation to Truth”; and “Against the Sociology of Knowledge”

- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapter 3 and part of Chapter 7, pp. 85-92.

- Makaryk Clusters 5 (Poststructuralism, Postmodernism) 6 (New Historicism, Foucault, Nietzsche, Power, Episteme), 7 (Barthes, Text, Textuality), 8 (Deconstruction, Derrida)

- Best-Kellner, “Foucault and the Critique of Modernity”
- Nehamas, “Subject and Object”
- Foucault, “What is an Author?”; and, from the *History of Sexuality*, vol. 1, “The Repressive Hypothesis,” pp. 17-49 and “Method,” pp. 92-102.
- Barthes, “The Discourse of History”; “From Work to Text”; and “The Death of the Author”
- Cf. Williams, *Marxism and Literature*, Ch. III.8, “Authors”)

- Krims, “Disciplining Deconstruction (for Music Analysis)”
- Kurth, “Music and Poetry, A Wilderness of Doubles: Heine—Nietzsche—Schubert—Derrida.”

- Lilla, “The Legitimacy of the Liberal Age” (extract: to be supplied) and “The Politics of Jacques Derrida”
- Eagleton, “Fallacies” and “Contradictions” (pp. 93-130, 131-135) from *The Illusions of Postmodernism*.
- Norris, “Marxism against Postmodernism, or The *Eighteenth Brumaire* Revisited,” from *Reclaiming Truth*.

Topic 6

Topic 5 continued: Gender, Sexuality, etc.

- Makaryk Clusters 9 (Psychoanalytic Theory, Lacan, Deleuze, Guattari), and 10 ([Early] Feminist Criticism)
- Dellamora, “Introduction: Masculine Desire and the Question of the Subject”
- Brett, “Musicality, Essentialism, and the Closet”
- *The New Republic* Nov-Dec 1998 Queer Theory Debate (Lee Siegel + Responses)

- Brett, Philip. “Piano Four Hands: Schubert and the Performance of Gay Male Desire”

Topic 7 **Narratives and Metanarratives**

- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapter 4
- Kracauer (extracts from *History: The Last Things before the First*: photocopies to be supplied)
- Lyotard, “Introduction” and Sections 1-10 of *The Postmodern Condition* (pp. xxiii-xxv, 3-41)

- Berkhofer, Chapters 2 (“Narratives and Historicization”), 3 (“Historical Representations and Truthfulness”), 4 (“The New Rhetoric, Poetics, and Criticism”), and 5 (“Emplotment: Historicizing Time”)

- Fay, Chapters 8 and 9

- Kramer, “Preface” and “Prospects: Postmodernism and Musicology,” in *Classical Music and Postmodern Knowledge*

- White, Chapter 1 (“The Value of Narrativity in the Representation of Reality”), 3 (“The Politics of Historical Interpretation”)

- Three Recent Discussions of White from *History and Theory* (1998):
 - Vann, “The Reception of Hayden White.
 - Partner, “Hayden White: The Form of the Content.”
 - Ankersmit: “Hayden White’s Appeal to the Historians.”

Topic 8 **Hermeneutics, Gadamer, etc.**

- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapter 5
- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapter 6

- Thompson, “Reception Theory and the Interpretation of Historical Meaning.”
- Fay, selections from Chs. 5 (at least 5.4, 5.5, and 5.6, especially Davidson’s principle of charity, Grandy’s principle of humanity, Winch’s concept of intelligibility), Ch. 6 (opening page or two, then at least 6.2, 6.4, 6.5), Ch. 7 (at least the initial paragraphs plus 7.2, 7.3, 7.4: Fay’s Gadamer, a discussion much influenced by Thompson, above)

- Makaryk Cluster 11 (Hermeneutics)
- Gadamer, *Truth and Method* extracts, 296-97, 366-ca.375, 383-89.

Topic 9 **Canons: The Domain of Study; Multiculturalism; Popular Culture**

- Dahlhaus, *Foundations*, Chapter 7, pp. 92-107
- Essay from Lentricchia, *Critical Terms for Literary Study*: Guillory, “Canon”

- Makaryk Cluster 12 (Canon; Black Criticism; Postcolonial Theory)

- Berkhofer, Ch. 7 (“Representing Multiple Viewpoints and Voices”)

Topic 10 **Debates (to be determined; these may include:)**

- Appleby-Hunt-Jacob Debate: conclusion of H-A-J and six extracts (3 + 3) from the *Journal of the History of Ideas* (1995) and *History and Theory* (1995)
- Pederson-Rumph / Potter-Applegate
- Berkhofer (selections from the remainder of the book) and Thomas S. Haskell review of Berkhofer, *History and Theory* (1998), 347-69.
- Danto debate: *The End of Art? History and Theory*.

Topic 11 **Envois: Recommendations, etc. Selected from(possible selections)**

- Fay, 11, "Conclusion," in *Contemporary Philosophy*, pp. 223-46; and Fay, "Nothing but History?"
- Martin, "Progress in Historical Studies"
- Horner, "On the Study of Music as Material Social Practice."
- Street, "Editorial: This Space for Rent?"
- others?